1	ROB BONTA Attorney General of California		
2	Attorney General of California MARK R. BECKINGTON Supervising Deputy Attorney General		
3	Supervising Deputy Attorney General ROBERT L. MEYERHOFF, SBN 298196 GABRIELLE D. BOUTIN, SBN 267308		
4	S. CLINTON WOODS, SBN 246054 CHARLES J. SAROSY, SBN 302439		
5	300 South Spring Street Suite 1702		
6	Los Angeles, CA 90013-1230 Telephone: (213) 269-6356 Fax: (916) 731-2119		
7	E-mail: Charles.Sarosy@doj.ca.gov Attorneys for Rob Bonta, in his official capacity as		
8	Attorney General of the State of California		
9	IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT		
10	FOR THE CENTRAL DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA		
11			
12			
13	LANCE BOLAND, ET AL.,	Case No. 8:22-cv-01421-CJC-ADS	
14			
	Plaintiffs	DEFENDANT'S ORIECTIONS TO	
15	Plaintiffs,	DEFENDANT'S OBJECTIONS TO DECLARATION OF BRIAN R. MARVEL SUPPORTING	
15 16	Plaintiffs, v.	DECLARATION OF BRIAN R. MARVEL SUPPORTING PLAINTIFFS' FIRST CLOSING	
	v. ROB BONTA, IN HIS OFFICIAL	DECLARATION OF BRIAN R. MARVEL SUPPORTING PLAINTIFFS' FIRST CLOSING BRIEF FOLLOWING EVIDENTIARY HEARING ON	
16	V.	DECLARATION OF BRIAN R. MARVEL SUPPORTING PLAINTIFFS' FIRST CLOSING BRIEF FOLLOWING	
16 17	v. ROB BONTA, IN HIS OFFICIAL CAPACITY AS ATTORNEY GENERAL OF	DECLARATION OF BRIAN R. MARVEL SUPPORTING PLAINTIFFS' FIRST CLOSING BRIEF FOLLOWING EVIDENTIARY HEARING ON PLAINTIFFS' MOTION FOR A PRELIMINARY INJUNCTION Courtroom: 9B	
16 17 18	V. ROB BONTA, IN HIS OFFICIAL CAPACITY AS ATTORNEY GENERAL OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA, ET AL.,	DECLARATION OF BRIAN R. MARVEL SUPPORTING PLAINTIFFS' FIRST CLOSING BRIEF FOLLOWING EVIDENTIARY HEARING ON PLAINTIFFS' MOTION FOR A PRELIMINARY INJUNCTION Courtroom: 9B Judge: Hon. Cormac J. Carney Trial Date: None set	
16 17 18 19	V. ROB BONTA, IN HIS OFFICIAL CAPACITY AS ATTORNEY GENERAL OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA, ET AL.,	DECLARATION OF BRIAN R. MARVEL SUPPORTING PLAINTIFFS' FIRST CLOSING BRIEF FOLLOWING EVIDENTIARY HEARING ON PLAINTIFFS' MOTION FOR A PRELIMINARY INJUNCTION Courtroom: 9B Judge: 9B Hon. Cormac J. Carney	
16 17 18 19 20	V. ROB BONTA, IN HIS OFFICIAL CAPACITY AS ATTORNEY GENERAL OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA, ET AL.,	DECLARATION OF BRIAN R. MARVEL SUPPORTING PLAINTIFFS' FIRST CLOSING BRIEF FOLLOWING EVIDENTIARY HEARING ON PLAINTIFFS' MOTION FOR A PRELIMINARY INJUNCTION Courtroom: 9B Judge: Hon. Cormac J. Carney Trial Date: None set	
16 17 18 19 20 21	V. ROB BONTA, IN HIS OFFICIAL CAPACITY AS ATTORNEY GENERAL OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA, ET AL.,	DECLARATION OF BRIAN R. MARVEL SUPPORTING PLAINTIFFS' FIRST CLOSING BRIEF FOLLOWING EVIDENTIARY HEARING ON PLAINTIFFS' MOTION FOR A PRELIMINARY INJUNCTION Courtroom: 9B Judge: Hon. Cormac J. Carney Trial Date: None set	
16 17 18 19 20 21 22	V. ROB BONTA, IN HIS OFFICIAL CAPACITY AS ATTORNEY GENERAL OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA, ET AL.,	DECLARATION OF BRIAN R. MARVEL SUPPORTING PLAINTIFFS' FIRST CLOSING BRIEF FOLLOWING EVIDENTIARY HEARING ON PLAINTIFFS' MOTION FOR A PRELIMINARY INJUNCTION Courtroom: 9B Judge: Hon. Cormac J. Carney Trial Date: None set	
16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	V. ROB BONTA, IN HIS OFFICIAL CAPACITY AS ATTORNEY GENERAL OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA, ET AL.,	DECLARATION OF BRIAN R. MARVEL SUPPORTING PLAINTIFFS' FIRST CLOSING BRIEF FOLLOWING EVIDENTIARY HEARING ON PLAINTIFFS' MOTION FOR A PRELIMINARY INJUNCTION Courtroom: 9B Judge: Hon. Cormac J. Carney Trial Date: None set	
16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24	V. ROB BONTA, IN HIS OFFICIAL CAPACITY AS ATTORNEY GENERAL OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA, ET AL.,	DECLARATION OF BRIAN R. MARVEL SUPPORTING PLAINTIFFS' FIRST CLOSING BRIEF FOLLOWING EVIDENTIARY HEARING ON PLAINTIFFS' MOTION FOR A PRELIMINARY INJUNCTION Courtroom: 9B Judge: Hon. Cormac J. Carney Trial Date: None set	
16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 25	V. ROB BONTA, IN HIS OFFICIAL CAPACITY AS ATTORNEY GENERAL OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA, ET AL.,	DECLARATION OF BRIAN R. MARVEL SUPPORTING PLAINTIFFS' FIRST CLOSING BRIEF FOLLOWING EVIDENTIARY HEARING ON PLAINTIFFS' MOTION FOR A PRELIMINARY INJUNCTION Courtroom: 9B Judge: Hon. Cormac J. Carney Trial Date: None set	

Defendant California Attorney General Rob Bonta hereby submits the following objections to the Declaration of Brian R. Marvel, president of the Peace Officers Research Association of California ("PORAC"), ECF No. 57-2, which was filed in support of Plaintiffs' first closing brief following the preliminary injunction hearing.

- 1. Defendant objects to the **entirety** of the declaration because Plaintiffs failed to make Mr. Marvel available at the evidentiary hearing for cross-examination. There is no explanation in Mr. Marvel's declaration for why he could not have testified at the hearing, and Plaintiffs were capable of doing so given that they made six other witnesses available for testimony both in person and via video conference. *See* ECF Nos. 41, 47.
- 2. Defendant objects to the **entirety** of the declaration because it constitutes improper opinion evidence. Fed. R. Evid. 701. Mr. Marvel is not testifying as an expert, and the statements in his declaration are not "helpful to . . . determining a fact in issue." Fed. R. Evid. 701(b). As the drafters of Rule 701 noted, "meaningless assertions which amount to little more than choosing up sides" should be excluded for lack of helpfulness. Fed. R. Evid. 701 advisory committee's note. Mr. Marvel acknowledges that the declaration's sole purpose is merely to take Plaintiffs' side in this case when he states in paragraph 18 that "PORAC would like the Court to be aware of its position" because it failed to file an amicus brief.
- 3. Defendant objects to **paragraphs 4, 5, 6, and 15** of the declaration for lack of relevance, because Mr. Marvel's and PORAC's views on the Unsafe Handgun Act ("UHA") are not "fact[s] [] of consequence in determining the action." Fed. R. Evid. 401(b).
- 4. Defendant objects to **paragraph 5** of the declaration for lack of foundation. Fed. R. Evid. 602. The declaration does not establish Mr. Marvel's basis for opining on the effectiveness of the UHA's chamber load indicator, magazine disconnect mechanism, and microstamping requirements.

- Defendant objects to lines 17 through 19 of paragraph 7 of the declaration for lack of foundation. Fed. R. Evid. 602. The declaration does not establish Mr. Marvel's basis for opining that "many officers are issued 4th or 5th-generation Glock pistols."
 Defendant objects to paragraphs 8 and 9 of the declaration for lack of relevance, because Mr. Marvel's and PORAC's views on the Second Amendment are not "fact[s] [] of consequence in determining the action." Fed. R. Evid. 401(b).
 Defendant objects to lines 3 through 6 of paragraph 9 of the declaration for lack of foundation. Fed. R. Evid. 602. The declaration does not establish Mr. Marvel's basis for opining that off-Roster handguns are "commonly issued to approximately 77,000 peace officers while they are on-duty in California."
 Defendant objects to paragraphs 11, 12, 13, and 14 of the declaration for lack of relevance, because Mr. Marvel's and PORAC's position on Senate Bill
- 8. Defendant objects to **paragraphs 11, 12, 13, and 14** of the declaration for lack of relevance, because Mr. Marvel's and PORAC's position on Senate Bill 377—a bill currently pending in the Legislature that is not before this Court and not relevant to the chamber load indicator, magazine disconnect mechanism, or microstamping requirements at issue here—are not "fact[s] [] of consequence in determining the action." Fed. R. Evid. 401(b).

1	Dated: March 10, 2023	Respectfully submitted,
2		ROB BONTA
3		Attorney General of California MARK R. BECKINGTON Supervising Deputy Attorney General
4		Supervising Deputy Attorney General ROBERT L. MEYERHOFF GABRIELLE D. BOUTIN
5		S. CLINTON WOODS Deputy Attorneys General
6		Deputy Tutorneys Constan
7		/s/ Charles J. Sarosy Charles J. Sarosy
8		CHARLES J. SAROSY Deputy Attorney General
9		Deputy Attorney General Attorneys for Rob Bonta, in his official capacity as Attorney General of the State of California
10		State of California
11 12		
13		
13		
15		
16		
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		
26		
27		
28		